

REMARKS

Applicant has carefully reviewed and considered the Office Action mailed on May 18, 2005, and the references cited therewith.

No claims are amended herein, no claims are canceled herein, and no claims are added herein; as a result, Claims 12-20 are now pending in this application.

Section 102 Rejection of the Claims

Claims 12, 13, 15, 16, 17, and 19 were rejected under 35 USC §102(b) as being anticipated by U.S. Patent 4,301,651 issued to Cocchiara et al. ("Cocchiara"). In support of this rejection, the Examiner alleges the following:

The Cocchiara elbow as shown in figs. 12 and 13 (see below) illustrates the present invention with a cylindrical body and tangential inlets outlets wherein the body includes a liner 40 and the inlets and outlets also include liners 42. The liners can be removed by any number of means.

Applicants respectfully disagree. Cocchiara does not teach or suggest limitations of the present claims. More specifically, Cocchiara does not teach or suggest at least one end that is removably attached nor does Cocchiara teach or suggest removable liners. To the contrary, Cocchiara teaches a welded (i.e., permanently attached) end. Additionally, Cocchiara does not teach or suggest a piping elbow comprising two substantially-identical components.

At column 5, lines 55-56, Cocchiara describes the reactor shown in FIG. 3 as having a base whose circular edges are *welded* to the circular edges at the end of the wall 31. Thus, the ends in the reactor of FIG. 3 are permanently attached, not removably attached. At column 8, lines 44-47, Cocchiara teaches that the reactor depicted in FIG. 13 (cited by the Examiner) is "similar to that shown in FIGS. 3 and 4, but provided with thermal insulation means to improve heat retention." Thus, the ends of the reactor depicted in FIG. 13 are also apparently welded (i.e., permanently attached). The teaching of welded ends in Cocchiara teaches away from the present invention as Claims 12-14 of the present invention require a first end and a second end, wherein at least one of the ends is removably attached. Accordingly, Claims 12-14 are patentable over Cocchiara.

Claims 15-18 of the present invention claim a piping elbow comprising two substantially-identical components. The present specification, especially at page 8, lines 11-28, teaches benefits from having a piping elbow comprised of two substantially identical parts. There is no

teaching or suggestion in Cocchiara of piping elbows comprising two substantially-identical components or the benefits of such piping elbows. Accordingly, Claims 15-18 of the present invention are patentable over Cocchiara.

Claims 12-18 of the present invention all require a body containing a removable liner. Cocchiara does not teach or suggest a body containing a removable liner and appears to teach away from a body with a removable liner. As discussed above, the ends in Cocchiara are welded or permanently attached. If the ends are permanently attached, the body liner can not be removed. Also, there is no teaching or suggestion in Cocchiara of a need to remove liners. Accordingly, Claims 12-18 are patentable over Cocchiara.

Claims 19 and 20 claim a method for adding a liner to a piping elbow. There is no teaching or suggestions of any of the limitations of Claims 19 and 20. In fact, there is no discussion at all in Cocchiara of how liners might be assembled other than that they are formed of thin stainless steel plate attached by crimping or expansion into engaging contact with the reactor wall (or by any other suitable method). See column 8, lines 54-57. Accordingly, Claims 19 and 20 are patentable over Cocchiara.

Section 103 Rejection of the Claims

Claims 14, 18 and 20 were rejected under 35 USC §103(a) as being unpatentable over Cocchiara in view of U.S. Patent 4,554,721 issued to Carty et al. ("Carty"). Carty is cited by the Examiner for Carty's use of ceramic as a lining material. As explained above, Claims 14, 18, and 20 have limitations that are neither taught nor suggested in Cocchiara. Those limitations are also neither taught nor suggested in Carty. Accordingly, Claims 14, 18, and 20 are patentable over Cocchiara and Carty even if they are considered properly combinable.

Conclusion

Applicant respectfully submits that the claims are in condition for allowance and notification to that effect is earnestly requested. The Examiner is invited to telephone Applicant's attorney (989-297-1298) to facilitate prosecution of this application.

If necessary, please charge any additional fees or credit overpayment to Deposit Account No. 11-0650

Respectfully submitted,

ROBERT O. MARTIN ET AL.

By their Representatives,

Customer Number 36732

Telephone Number 989-297-1298

Date August 10, 2005

By Stanley K Hill
Stanley K Hill
Reg. No. 37,548

CERTIFICATE UNDER 37 CFR 1.8: The undersigned hereby certifies that this correspondence is being deposited with the United States Postal Service with sufficient postage as first class mail, in an envelope addressed to: Mail Stop Amendment, Commissioner of Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450, on this 10 day of August, 2005.

Chris Hannard

Name

Chris Hannard

Signature